Phyletic evolution and iterative speciation in the persistent *Pristiograptus dubius* lineage

ADAM URBANEK, SIGITAS RADZEVIČIUS, ANNA KOZŁOWSKA, and LECH TELLER



Urbanek, A., Radzevičius, S., Kozłowska, A., and Teller, L. 2012. Phyletic evolution and iterative speciation in the persistent *Pristiograptus dubius* lineage. *Acta Palaeontologica Polonica* 57 (3): 589–611.

The paper focuses on patterns of the evolution of the simplest and longest-ranging (approximately 18 Ma) Silurian graptolite *Pristiograptus dubius*. The *Pristiograptus dubius* species group consists of the *P. dubius* stem lineage represented by a sequence of a number of subspecies displaying only small morphological changes as well as derivative species produced from the stem lineage by means of iterative speciation. This long raging graptolite lineage is the only one, apart of one retiolitid, which survived the most severe environmental event for graptolites, the *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Event. Based on three-dimensional, isolated material two *P. dubius* groups taxa are distinguished. One group has an obtuse angle between the thecal lip and the succeeding thecal wall, the second group has a right or acute angle. Other characters differentiating *P. dubius* forms are: the shape of the apertural lips, differences in rhabdosome shape and size, and a different number of sicular rings. Sixteen species and subspecies of *Pristiograptus* from the East European Platform, Poland and Lithuania are discussed. Five new subspecies *P. dubius magnus*, *P. dubius paezerensis*, *P. dubius praelodenicensis*, *P. dubius postfrequens*, and *P. dubius postmagnus* are proposed.

Key words: Graptolithina, *Pristiograptus dubius* stem lineage, *P. dubius* species group, iterative speciation, Silurian, East European Platform, Poland, Lithuania.

Adam Urbanek [urbanek@twarda.pan.pl], Anna Kozłowska [akd@twarda.pan.pl], and Lech Teller, Instytut Paleobiologii PAN, ul. Twarda 51/55, PL-00-818 Warszawa, Poland; Sigitas Radzevičius [sigitas.radzevicius@gf.vu.lt], Department of Geology and Mineralogy, Vilnius University, M.K. Čiurlionio 21/27, Vilnius, LT2000, Lithuania.

Received 16 June 2010, accepted 13 June 2011, available online 17 June 2011.

Introduction

Pristiograptus dubius (Suess, 1851) ranges from the *Monograptus riccartonensis* Biozone of the Wenlock to the *Monograptus perneri* Biozone of the Přidoli and thus is one of the longest-ranging graptolite taxa known (Fig. 1). Both thecae and rhabdosome are simple. The *Pristiograptus* stem lineage represents a type of evolution that shows numerous new lineages arising by means of iterative speciation (Urbanek 1998).

Přibyl (1943) first distinguished more than a dozen *Pristio-graptus* species and subspecies, based on flattened material from the Czech Republic. The first detailed studies of isolated, three-dimensional *Pristiograptus dubius* forms were made by Urbanek (1953) who also reviewed some earlier papers and then followed by Urbanek (1959, 1997) and Walker (1953) based on Ludlow material from Poland and northern Germany, respectively. These studies noted the presence of thick-ening rings in the sicula. Urbanek's (1997, 1998) studies, additionally, gave a general view of the extraordinary evolution of the *P. dubius* group.

Jaeger (1959, 1991) also studied the *Pristiograptus* in Germany using isolated material. Rickards (1965) investigated pristiograptids from Northern England and from Aus-

tralia (Rickards and Wright 1999), and an attempt at understanding the evolution of the *P. dubius* group was presented by Rickards and Wright (2003).

Holland et al. (1969) described a new species *P. jaegeri* Holland, Rickards, and Warren, 1969 from the upper Wenlock and lowermost Ludlow of Great Britain. More detailed studies of that important appearance and succession of *Pristiograptus* species after the *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* extinction Event were made by Ulst (in Gailite et al. 1967; Ulst 1974), based on material from Latvia. She described the diminutive *Pristiograptus parvus* Ulst, 1975, the only monograptid taxon to appear immediately after the most severe extinction event in graptolite history.

Pristiograptus taxa from the Llandovery to Ludlow interval of Lithuania were studied by Paškevičius (1974, 1979). The most recent revision of *P. dubius* morphotypes, based on isolated Wenlock material from Lithuania, was made by Radzevičius and Paškevičius (2000), and Radzevičius (2003, 2006, 2007).

The *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Extinction Event was probably the only one to severely affect the evolution of *P. dubius* lineage. It survived other less severe events that extinguished many co-existing taxa. This exceptional survivability of *P. dubius* may probably be explained by eurybiotic nature of its

	ACTA PALAE	ONTOLC	GICA POLONICA 57 (3), 2	2012
te	Pristiograptus dubius group taxa	ular Juli	Clades of iterative	

Bit Openation	es	ges	Generalized	Graptolite	Pristiograptus dubius group taxa								ular nuli	Clades of iterative					
MEMOOK I. transgrediens I. transgrediens <thi. th="" transgrediens<=""> I. transgr</thi.>	Seri	biozones		(this paper)	Stem linage taxa			Iterative taxa			Sic	P. dubius group							
Methodologial Optimized and the second s			I. transgrediens	I. transgrediens	1														
WENCOCK Wencock Million Biolographic Million Construction Million Construction <		M. bouceki	Cyrto. perneri			SL													
Methodol Metho				M. bouceki	1				ivo		s								
Mercocl. lochkovensis Neocol. brankensis Neocol. brankensi				I. t. samsonowiczi					SN	arsl		atu		byi		ιλα			
Memocol. Neocol. lochkovensis Neocol. lochkovensis Neocol. jorkinneriss Neocol. jorkinneris Neocol. jorki	PŘII	Neocol. lochkovensis	I. t. chelmensis					200	she		labi		s					itus	
Memolian Memolian Alternoodian Alternoodian Alternoodian Alternoodian <t< td=""><td>Neocol. Drafiikerisis</td><td>Neocol. lochkovensis</td><td>1</td><td></td><td colspan="2"></td><td>1 interest</td><td>d, b</td><td></td><td>ius</td><td></td><td colspan="3">nus d. s</td><td></td><td>abia</td></t<>		Neocol. Drafiikerisis	Neocol. lochkovensis	1				1 interest	d, b		ius		nus d. s				abia		
Meocol. parultimus Neocol. parultimus Neocol. parultimus Neocol. parultimus B. bohemicus tenuis U. spineus U. spineus U. spineus U. acer Slov. ballicus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus Neocol.unutus S. leintwardinensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis C. Ol. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis C. Ol. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis C. Ol. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis C. drugins Col. praedeubeli Col. praedeubeli Col. ludensis C. drugins M. helophorus M. helophorus M. helophorus H. parus M. antennularius M. antennularius M. antennularius M. antennularius M. antennularius M. antennularius			Neocol.ultimus	Neocol. ultimus	d. p					б С		dub		nag P.			Ľ.		d. k
Menucock U. spineus U. protospineus U. protospineus U. acer Silov. balticus Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. inexpectatus B. praecomutus B. praecomutus S. leintwardinensis S. leintwardinensis Cucullo. hemiaversus L. progenitor Neodiver. nilssoni Neodiver. nilssoni Col. praedeubeli Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. praedeubeli Col. praedeubeli Col. praedeubeli Col. praedeubeli Col. praedeubeli D. o O M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. antennularius M. niccartonensis M. niccartonensis M. niccartonen			Neocol.parultimus	Neocol. parultimus			ſ	С.		201		<i>с</i> .		ostn				I I	С.
Menuncipadian U. protospineus U. acer U. acer Silov. balticus Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. inexpectatus B. bohemicus tenuis B. cornutus B. praecomutus B. praecomutus S. leintwardinensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. praedeubeli Col. ludensis Col. nassaa Col. ludensis Col. nassaa P. parvus P. parvus P. dripins babahorus M.				U. spineus					† 9					d.b.		Ч		- I	
Menuocital U. acer Slow. ballicus U. acer Slow. ballicus Slow. ballicus Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. kozlowskii Neocucul. inexpectatus B. bohemicus tenuis B. comutus B. praecomutus B. comutus B. praecomutus Cucullo. hemiaversus L. induitie L. induitie Veodiver. nilssoni C. J. praedeubeli Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Cord. praedeubeli Col. ludensis Cord. praedeubeli Col. ludensis Cord. praedeubeli Col. ludensis Cord. M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. priccartonensis M. niccartonensis M. irccartonensis M. niccartonensis M. incertonensis M. niccartonensis			F. formosus	U. protospineus									с						
Memory Slov. patiticus Meocucul. koztowskii Neocucul. koztowskii Neocucul. koztowskii Neocucul. koztowskii B. braecomutus B. praecomutus S. leintwardinensis S. leintwardinensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Cyrto. rigidus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. niccartonensis M. antennularius M. riccatonensis M. antennularius M. riccatonensis M. antennularius M. riccatonensis M. antennularius M. riccatonensis M. antennularius M. biophorus M. belophorus M. antennularius <				U. acer												1			
MENDOC Menoration Menoration Sheinwooddan Sheinwooddan Sheinwooddan Sheinwooddan Homerian Sheinwooddan Sheinwooddan Homerian Sheinwooddan Sheinwooddan Homerian Sheinwooddan Sheinwooddan Homerian Gorstian Homerian France Gorstian Homerian France France Sileintwardinensis Sileintwardinensis France Sileintwardinensis France France Homerian France France		L C		Slov. balticus					1 -										
Menton Menton Menton Menton Menton Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Homerian Ludfor Sheinwoodian Homerian Homerian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Homerian Homerian Gorstan Ludfor Sheinwoodian Homerian Bisus Sheinwoodian Homerian Ludfor Sheinwoodian Homerian Homerian Gorstan Ludfor Ludfor Sisterian Sisterian Sisterian Gorstan Ludfor Ludfor Sisterian Sisterian Sisterian Gorstan Ludfor Ludfor Sisterian Sisterian Sisterian Sisterian Gorstan Ludfor Sisterian Circlo Indianensis F. dubius secons F. dubius secons Sisterian Sisterian Lindfor Sisterian M. riccartonensis M. sardons M. autennularius Homerian F. dubius secon F. auth	diar	Neocucul. kozlowskii	Neocucul. kozlowskii			su	2	a a											
MENLOCK Menuncation Menunucation Menuncation	<	dfor	B. bohemicus tenuis	Neocucul. inexpectatus			ane		cha									Φ	(0
WENLOCK Wentan Menuncation Menuncation Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Gorstian Homerian Sheinwoodian Homerian Gorstian Homerian Station Homerian Gorstian Gorstian Station Homerian Gorstian Gorstian Neodiver. uilssou Corculo remains Station Gorstian Neodiver. uilssou Col robus F. dubius parud dubius parud dubius Produpturs Prodoren: Color robus Color robus Produpturs Produpturs P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius parud dubius parud dubius Produpturs Produpturs P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius gradue W. viccautonensis W. viccautonensis P. dubius gradue P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius paredonenciensis P. dubius dubius P. dubius dubius P. dubius parec	Price TUDLOV	Luc		Neolob. auriculatus			fre		vel			ens					Ø	cha	sue
Mediver. uilssoni B. braecountra P. dubius F. dubius P. dubius F. dubius P. dubius Col. Indensis Col. Indensis Col. Indensis P. dubius Aubius P. dubius Col. Indensis P. dubius Col. Indensis P. dubius Col. Indensis P. dubius Col. Indigeni P. dubius Col. Indigeni P. dubius Col. Indigeni P. dubius Col. neadensi M. riccartonensis M. inceartonensis P. dubius M. inceartonensis P. dubius P. dubius				B. cornutus			sius		ĮĮ.			esc						wel	esc
S. leintwardinensis S. leintwardinensis S. leintwardinensis S. leintwardinensis F. scanicus Cucullo. hemiaversus F. invertus F. invertus F. scanicus F. brogenitor Neodiver. nilssoni Neodiver. nilssoni Veodiver. nilssoni Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. scatours Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Col. ludensis Bernor Cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus M. riccartonensis M. antennularius M. antennularius M. riccartonensis M. niccartonensis M. niccartonensis				B. praecornutus			dut		<i>d</i> .			m					lage	jf.	tum
MENLOCK Menlock Sheinwoodian Homerian Second and the seco		S. leintwardinensis	S. leintwardinensis			σ.					<i>Ч</i> .					li.	<u> </u>	σ.	
MENLOCK T. iuncartonensis T. iuncartonensis Mentock F. scauicras F. scauicras F. scauicras Meodiver. uilssoni F. budius F. budius Correction Meodiver. uilssoni F. budius Correction Correction Meodiver. uilssoni F. budius Correction Correction Meodiver. uilssoni Correction Correction Correction M. viccautous Correction Correction Correction M. viccautous W. sardous Contraction Correction P. dubius Contro fubrius Contro fubrius Contro fubrius P. dubius Conticensis Contrisensis Co			L. scanicus	Cucullo. hemiaversus									_				ear		
Mentian Filter Constituent Co		an		L. invertus													roup st		
Mendiversion F. balanna Mendiversion Mendiversion <td></td> <td>rsti</td> <td>L. scanicus</td> <td>1</td> <td>ŝ</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>sis -</td> <td>1</td> <td></td> <td colspan="2"></td> <td></td> <td></td>		rsti		L. scanicus	1	ŝ						sis -	1						
Meodiver. ullssouit Meodiver. ullssouit Mendiver. And the intervence Sheinwoodi Sheinwoodi And the intervence Neodiver. ullssouit Mendiver. And the intervence Neodiver. ullssouit Mendiver. And the intervence Standous Mendiver. And the intervence Col. Indensition Mendiver. And bits Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Mendiver. And the intervence Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Col. Indensition And the intervence Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Col. Indensition And the intervence Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Col. Indensition And the intervence Mention Mention Col. Indensition Col. Indensition Col. Indensition And the intervence Mention Mention Mention Col. Indensition Mention		Ö	Neodiver. nilssoni	L. progenitor	:	pin				sis		cen					s g	s.	
Sheinwoodian Sheinwoodian MENLOCK Sheinwoodian Annerian Col. Indeusis Col. Indeusis Col. Indensis Col. Indeusis Col. Indensis Col. Indeusis Col. Indensis Col. Indeusis P. barvins Col. Col. Col. Col. Col. Col. Col. Col.				Neodiver. nilssoni	- For	npc	snv			rens		enia				is	lidi	ISUé	
Col. dennient Col. den			Col. ludensis	Col. ludensis		pne	par		IS	eze		us Iod sis]		ens	qı	nice	sis
Col. braedenpeli Col. braedenpeli Col. braedenpeli Col. braedenpeli Col. braedenpeli N Viccattonensis Col. braedenpeli Col. braedenpeli Pi dubius N Viccattonensis M. autenunnations Pi dubius P Chain Mission Mission P Chain Chain Chain N Viccattonensis M. autenunnations Pi dubius P P. dubius M. pelobhorns M. autenunnations P P. dubius M. autenunnations Pi dubius P P. dubius P. dubius Pi dubius P P. dubius Pi dubius Pi dubius P P. dubius Pi dubius Pi dubius P P. dubius Pi dubius Pi dubius	WENLOCK heinwoodian Homerian	Col. deubeli	Col. deubeli		pse	snj		gnu	s sp		rdo)rae cen	ထု	Pristiograptus sp.	I. magnus	zer		ode	ens	
And Construction		Col. praedeubeli	Col. praedeubeli		ius	qnp		ma	ptus ius		s sa us p lenii	6			pae		aeli	enic	
P. parvus P. parvus P. parvus P. parvus Cyrto. lundgreni Cyrto. lundgreni Cyrto. lundgreni Cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. riccartonensis M. antennularius M. riccartonensis M. riccartonensis		G. nassa	G. nassa		dub	ď.		ius	gra, dub	5	lous lubii lod				ď.		. pr	lode	
Cyrto. lundgreni Cyrto. lundgreni Cyrto. lundgreni right di di di di di di <th di<="" t<="" td=""><td>P. parvus</td><td>P. parvus</td><td>ius</td><td>σ.</td><td rowspan="2"></td><td>qnp</td><td>P. P.</td><td>: </td><td>P. d P. d</td><td></td><td>С.</td><td>С</td><td>σ.</td></th>		<td>P. parvus</td> <td>P. parvus</td> <td>ius</td> <td>σ.</td> <td rowspan="2"></td> <td>qnp</td> <td>P. P.</td> <td>: </td> <td>P. d P. d</td> <td></td> <td>С.</td> <td>С</td> <td>σ.</td>	P. parvus	P. parvus	ius	σ.			qnp	P. P.	:	P. d P. d					С.	С	σ.
Image: Cyrto. perneri Cyrto. perneri Cyrto. perneri Sign of the cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus Sign of the cyrto. rigidus M. belophorus M. belophorus M. antennularius M. riccartonensis M. riccartonensis M. riccartonensis		Cyrto. lundgreni	Cyrto. lundgreni	qnp	L	ď.			Pri		<u>с</u>			Р.			ĹĹ		
Cyrto. rigidus Cyrto. rigidus G M. belophorus M. belophorus Image: Cyrto. rigidus M. riccartonensis M. antennularius M. riccartonensis Image: Cyrto. rigidus		Cyrto. perneri	Cyrto. perneri	ius	F			T	Τ.					1					
M. belophorus M. belophorus C. M. riccartonensis M. antennularius M. riccartonensis		Cyrto. rigidus	Cyrto. rigidus	dub	L				•			0					1	6	
Image: Second state of the se		M. belophorus	M. belophorus	Ч.	L			1.									1	lous	
が M. riccartonensis Q		Miricoartopopoio	M. antennularius		•						-							sarc	
	ี ร		w. necanonensis	M. riccartonensis														1	<i>с</i> .

Fig. 1. Graptolite phylogenetic relationships between the iterative of *Pristiograptus dubius* group taxa species and subspecies from Poland and Lithuania and their stratigraphical ranges. For more data concerning iterative clades that branched off the stem lineage see Fig. 4. Generalized graptolites biozones (Koren' et al. 1996) correlated with biozones of Poland and Lithuania (Urbanek and Teller 1997; Radzevičius 2007). Abbreviations: *B., Bohemograptus; Col., Colonograptus; Cucullo., Cucullograptus; Cyrto., Cyrtograptus; d., dubius; G., Gothograptus; I., Istrograptus; L., Lobograptus; M., Monograptus; Neocol., Neoclonograptus; Neocucul., Neocucullograptus; Neodiver., Neodiversograptus; Neolob., Neolobograptus; P., Pristiograptus; S., Saetograptus; Slov., Slovinograptus; t., transgrediens; U., Uncinatograptus.*

adaptation and lack of specialization. This is why Jaeger (1991) called it "a generalist". The long period of existence of *P. dubius* is doubtlessly related to its ability to adapt to environmental changes, without responding by any considerable morphological change.

The purpose of this paper is an attempt to understand the evolution of *P. dubius* group and show its iterative character, extraordinary among graptolites. The paper describes the morphological changes and stratigraphic distribution of isolated *P. dubius* forms from Wenlock and Ludlow strata of Poland and Lithuania (Fig. 2).

This paper employs terminology (Fig. 3) from Urbanek (1997) and Radzevičius (2003).

Institutional abbreviations.—ZPAL G., Institute of Paleobiology, Polish Academy of Sciences; VU, collection of Vilnius University, Department of Geology and Mineralogy, Geological Museum.

Other abbreviations.—L, length; W, width; β , the angle between the thecal lip and the free ventral wall of succeeding theca; λ , the angle between interthecal septum (thecal axis) and virgula; th, theca; th¹, first theca (Fig. 3); SEM, Scanning



Fig. 2. Map of western margin of the East European Platform. A. Facies across the studied region (modified after Porebska et al. 2004). B. Location of the investigated boreholes in Lithuania and Poland.

Electron Microscope; K, borehole Kybartai; S, borehole Šiupyliai; P, borehole Paežeriai.

Evolution in the Silurian *Pristiograptus dubius* (Suess, 1851) species group

The *Pristiograptus dubius* species group consists of (i) the proper *P. dubius* stem lineage represented by an unbroken succession of *P. dubius* populations (chronodemes), displaying essentially a morphological near-stasis, and therefore showing only limited change through time, (ii) representatives of a numbers of phyletic lines which appeared as the result of early divergence immediately after the *P. dubius/Gothograptus nassa* survival interval, as well as of a number (iii) of derivative species produced by means of iterative speciation from the stem lineage parental species, and displaying usually minor differences from it.

Phyletic evolution.—The concept of the stem lineage developed gradually. Urbanek (1997, 1998) and Rickards and Wright (2003) considered that a stem lineage is represented by a single species or even subspecies. Other observations suggested, however, a certain amount of variation between successive populations. Urbanek (1997) recognized a fluctuating variation expressed in the degree of robustness of the rhabdosome. A gracile morphotype is present in the Gorstian, represented by *P. dubius frequens* Jaekel, 1889, substituted at higher horizons (*Pseudomonoclimacis latilobus– Monograptus* [*Slovinograptus*] *balticus* biozones) by a much more robust morphotype, with taxa having strong virgula and thick virgella. A gracile morphotype, however, reappears again in higher horizons of the Ludfordian (*P. dubius welchae*).

Besides fluctuating morphological changes, Urbanek (1997) recognized a directional (anagenetic) trend in the number and placement of sicular rings (annuli). In the Gorstian, sicular rings vary in number (up to 8) and in position, while in the Ludfordian there are always 3 rings occupying the same position on the sicula (Fig. 1). Urbanek (1997) provisionally classified this latter form as *P. dubius* cf. *frequens*, relying on



Fig. 3. Morphology of graptolite *Pristiograptus* rhabdosomes. **A**. Drawing of rhabdosome showing its characters (modified from Radzevičius 2003). **B–E**. Morphological features on flattened specimens. **B**. *Pristiograptus lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1948; VU-813, Likënai-396 borehole, Lithuania, depth 589.5 m; *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone, Riga Formation. **C**. *Pristiograptus dubius magnus* subsp. nov., VU-835, Parovėja-9 borehole, Lithuania, depth 599.8 m; *Cyrtograptus perneri* Biozone, whole specimen (C₁), enlargement showing thecal apertural lip (C₂). **D**. *Pristiograptus dubius pseudodubius* (Bouček, 1932), fragment of rhabdosome, VU-A3-0047a; *C. lundgreni* Biozone, Żdanów outcrop, Sudetes, Poland. **E**. *Pristiograptus jaegeri* Holland, Rickards, and Warren, 1969; Vilkaviškis-131 borehole, depth 1073.2 m, VU-8004, *Colonograptus deubeli* Biozone. Abbreviations: ß, angle between thecal lip and wall of succeeding theca; λ , angle between interthecal septum (thecal axis) and virgule; r, sicula ring; th¹, first theca; tal, thecal apertural lip.

general similarity. In this paper, this form is distinguished as new subspecies *P. dubius postfrequens* subsp. nov.

Taking into account the stratigraphic range of the P. dubius lineage (from the Monograptus crispus Biozone of the Llandovery to the Cyrtograptus perneri Biozone of the Přidoli) and its duration (estimated by Jaeger 1991, as about 20 Ma, but in the light of currently available radiometric data the time span in question might be some 12 Ma), certain microevolution within the stem species seemed almost inevitable. This is also recently indicated by the studies of Radzevičius (2003) on chemically isolated material from deep boreholes of Lithuania and the Polish Lowland. He has suggested the following succession of subspecific variants within the initial portion of the stem lineage: Pristiograptus dubius dubius-P. dubius pseudodubius-P. dubius parvus-P. dubius frequens-P. dubius postfrequens subsp. nov. The succession of the remaining part of the stem lineage is still not recognized, the first of the mentioned subspecies being

probably preceded by the diminutive and little known Upper Llandovery *P. dubius initialis* (Kirste, 1919) (compare Jaeger 1991). As the study of *Pristiograptus* species has been proceeding piecemeal, particular taxa were differently ranked (as species or subspecies), but in the above list all are treated as subspecies of *P. dubius*, taking into account limited morphological differences and the presence of transient forms during its long evolution.

In Europe immediately following the *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* extinction event, the *P. dubius* lineage is represented solely by the dwarf subspecies *P. dubius parvus* (see above), while pristiograptids from the *P. dubius* group with a normal size of rhabdosome reappear above the *P. parvus* horizon and are represented by *P. dubius frequens* (see Jaeger 1991). However, in other regions of the world the situation is different. In Central Asia Koren' and Urbanek (1994) were unable to recognize *P. parvus* in their carefully measured sections. It is likely that immediately above the *C. lundgreni* extinction horizon there, the retiolitid *Gothograptus nassa* (Holm, 1890) is associated with *P. dubius* of normal size. The same seems to be true for Arctic Canada (Lenz and Kozłowska-Dawidziuk 2002). It seems that in different, parts of the world the *P. dubius* lineage was represented in the early post-*C. lundgreni* time by coeval, vicarious subspecies, namely either by a dwarf variety *P. dubius parvus* or by normal-sized *P. dubius*. At present, these early post-*C. lundgreni* normal-sized representatives are insufficiently known morphologically and cannot be assigned taxonomically to any subspecies.

A special role in stratigraphy and phylogeny was played by the diminutive *P. dubius parvus*. However, the origin as well as the nature of this subspecies is disputed. According to Jaeger (1991) the dwarf variety was "always" present in *P. dubius* populations but because it was rare it remained unnoticed. However, under the stress conditions caused by environmental changes related to the *C. lundgreni* Event, this variety (probably a mutation) proved to be better adapted, in some parts of the world, than the normal forms with long rhabdosomes and underwent a rapid numerical increase, marking a distinct horizon (*P. parvus* Biozone). After the recovery of environmental conditions the dwarf mutation was replaced by populations showing a normal size of rhabdosome that had survived "somewhere".

Urbanek (1993) emphasized that P. parvus populations display characteristics that he has called the post-event syndrome, namely a monospecific mass occurrence as well as reduced size of rhabdosome, that he called the Lilliput effect. Dwarfism in particular could be interpreted as an ecophenetic reaction on general impoverishment of environmental conditions and at the same time the main cause of mass extinction. Biological causation of the post-Event syndrome is discussed in Urbanek (1993), while Twitchett (2007) discussed a wide occurrence of the Lilliput effect close to horizons of mass extinction at different stratigraphic settings. All authors agree that in Europe the dwarf variety P. dubius parvus was later replaced by P. dubius frequens representing the mainstream evolution and being soon followed by one of the greatest population and adaptive radiation bursts among graptolites (Koren' and Urbanek 1994). The status of P. dubius parvus is difficult to evaluate: it differs from standard iterative taxa of the P. dubius group, as it completely replaced the normalsized form on a continental scale, making its first appearance immediately after a major biotic crisis. If we interpret the subnormal size of P. parvus as a result of the Lilliput effect, the range of its distribution might be interpreted as the area characterized by extreme environmental conditions. For these reasons we consider P. dubius parvus provisionally as a link in the evolution of the stem lineage taxa.

One of the products of the post-extinction big radiation was again the conservative *P. dubius* stem lineage, accompanied by the ancestors of a number of progressive lineages which split from the main stock of *P. dubius* as a result of early divergence. They exhibited a great evolutionary potential producing on the one hand cucullograptids, bohemograptids including the horned bohemograptids and, related to them, neocucullograptids as well as multiramous linograptids and on the other hand spinose monograptids (*Colonograptus, Saetograptus*) and specialized ones such as *Colonograptus deubeli* (Jaeger, 1959). At the same time the *Pristiograptus dubius* stem lineage emerged from an early divergences without greater morphological changes, representing a conservative morphotype, capable of further near-stasis. Great amounts of variation, needed as raw material for this diversification, were probably generated during the population burst, recorded taphonomically as mass abundances of graptolite remains (Koren' and Urbanek 1994) in the *Pristiograptus dubius/ Gothograptus nassa* Biozone.

Iterative and parapatric speciation.—Therefore one should distinguish taxa produced during the early divergence, from *Pristiograptus* species repeatedly produced from the stem lineage and termed by Rickards and Wright (2003) as an iterative species. This term was also applied by Koren' and Urbanek (1994: 150) and Urbanek (1998: 561–563). These species are derivatives of stem lineage taxa, and were produced at different times, either before or after the *P. dubius/G. nassa* Event. As a rule they are usually of short duration, differing only in a few characters from the parental stem species. In their careful revision of iterative species derived from the stem lineage Rickards and Wright (2003) have distinguished some 5 "robust" and 8 "gracile" ones.

A classical example of an iterative speciation process may be the appearance of incipient bilateral apertural lobes in Neocolonograptus parultimus (Jaeger, 1975) which were developed from the persistent stem lineage of Pristiograptus dubius in the early Přidoli (Urbanek 1997). Similar structures developed many times, heterochronously and independently from the stem lineage of P. dubius with straight apertural margins (Fig. 3). According to Urbanek (1998), within the early Ludlow to late Přidoli time span, these iterations occurred at least five times, producing in each case a short lateral clade which branched off the P. dubius stem lineage, namely: Colonograptus praedeubeli-Saetograptus chimaera clade A, Pseudomonoclimacis latilobus clade B, P. d. labiatus clade C, Neocolonograptus parultimus-N. lochkovensis clade D, and Istrograptus transgrediens clade E displaying isochronous parallelism to clade D. Apertural elaborations attain in each case a different degree of expressivity (Fig. 4), from gentle elevations of the apertural rim (weak expressivity), through distinct lateral lobes (moderate expressivity) to strongly developed lobes overhanging the aperture (strong expressivity). In fact, the first of these clades (Fig. 1) branched off so early that it may be considered also as one of the early divergent phyletic lines (compare Koren' and Urbanek 1994). Morphological effects of changes are also somewhat greater: lateral lappets being provided in terminal forms with an additional structure in the form of the spines (Fig. 4). In most cases the early representatives of particular clades reveal low expressivity of the newly introduced character, later being subject to gradual increase. But these are exceptions to the rule and some iterative species



Fig. 4. The distribution and degree of expression of paired lateral apertural elevations or lobes within iterative clades that branched off the graptolite *Pristiograptus dubius* stem lineage (modified after Urbanek 1998).

display strong expressivity of new characters from the very beginning (Urbanek 1997).

Some iterative species reveal remarkable homeomorphy, as in the case of *Pristiograptus lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1948 from the upper Wenlock and *P. dubius labiatus* Urbanek, 1997 from the upper part of Ludfordian, which form almost

identical apertural elaborations (Fig. 4). Therefore as the *P. dubius* stem lineage shows no significant alteration of its evolutionary potential, producing remarkably similar iterative species separated by a few Ma, it seems that iterative speciation in each case involved only a small fraction of the existing parental gene system the vast majority remaining intact. The survival of parental species along with daughter species provides evidence that the evolutionary potential of the stem species, remains essentially unchanged (compare Koren' and Urbanek 1994; Urbanek 1998).

Therefore application of the "nodal principle" of cladistic taxonomy demanding that after each speciation the ancestral species should be given different binominals seems unjustified and undesirable in view of parsimony of nomenclature (see Urbanek 1996 for detailed discussion). An application of non-cladistic understanding of the relations between *P. dubius* stem species and iteratively derived species was suggested by Urbanek (1996, 1998). In this practice, the surviving ancestral species retains its previous name even after iterative speciation of a new species. This is justified by the mode of speciation used by an iterative species that does not break the cohesion of the ancestral lineage and involves only peripheral populations that later became isolated or semi-isolated as in the case of parapatric speciation.

Rickards and Wright (2003) mention as a remarkable fact that the stem taxon *P. dubius* always occurs in the same strata as species derived by iteration. They explain this co-occurrence by adaptation to different depth zones or hydrodynamic regime. The distribution of both species in question may be also related to a parapatric mode of speciation, considered by some zoogeographers as a common phenomenon in marine macrozooplankton (van der Spoel 1983). Iterative species, branching off the stem lineage, may be considered as probable examples of the parapatric mode of speciation.

An exceptional role of the *P. dubius* stem lineage, in the phylogeny of monograptids, relies on it being a persistent source of non-specialized morphologies, capable of easy specialization under suitable conditions. *P. dubius* as the stem species and all iterative species derived from it form a monophyletic group which may be called a genealogical do-

Fig. 5. SEM micrographs showing thecal lip variations in proximal thecae in graptolites Pristiograptus and Colonograptus praedeubeli (Jaeger, 1991). A, D, H. Parovėja-9 borehole, Lithuania. A. Pristiograptus dubius dubius (Suess, 1851), VU S.P9-31, depth 644.8 m; Monograptus riccartonensis Biozone. D. Pristiograptus sp. sensu Radzevičius, 2003, VU S.P9-219, depth 595.4 m; Cyrtograptus perneri Biozone. H. Pristiograptus lodenicensis Přibyl, 1943, VU P.P9-4b, depth 561.9 m; Cyrtograptus lundgreni Biozone. B, C, E-G, I. Zawada borehole, Poland. B. Pristiograptus dubius pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932), ZPAL G.44/2, depth 1584.9-1590.6 m; Cyrtograptus perneri Biozone. C. Pristiograptus dubius magnus subsp. nov., ZPAL G.44/3, depth 1577.5–1582.5 m; Cyrtograptus perneri Biozone. E. Pristiograptus sardous (Gortani, 1922), ZPAL G.44/8, depth 1590.6–1597.7 m; Cyrtograptus rigidus Biozone. F, G. Pristiograptus dubius paezerensis subsp. nov.; Cyrtograptus lundgreni Biozone. F. ZPAL G.44/10, Zawada borehole, Poland, depth 1546.5-1552.7 m. G. ZPAL G.44/17, Bartoszyce borehole, Poland, depth 1663.2 m, mature rhabdosome. I. Pristiograptus dubius praelodenicensis subsp. nov., ZPAL G.44/6, depth 1546.5-1552.7 m; Cyrtograptus lundgreni Biozone. J. Pristiograptus parvus Ulst, 1974, VU P.K14-108, Kybartai-14 borehole, Lithuania, depth 1071.7 m; Pristiograptus parvus Biozone. K. Pristiograptus virbalensis Paškevičius, 1974, VU P.S87-71, Sutkai-87 borehole, Lithuania, depth 768.9 m; Colonograptus praedeubeli Biozone. L. Colonograptus praedeubeli (Jaeger, 1991), ZPAL G.44/23, Bartoszyce IG-1borehole, Poland, depth 1643.9 m; Colonograptus praedeubeli Biozone. M. Pristiograptus dubius frequens Jaekel, 1889, ZPAL G.44/30, Baltic erratic boulder S36, Gdańsk, Poland; Lobograptus scanicus Biozone. N-R. Mielnik-1 borehole, Poland. N. Pristiograptus dubius tumescens (Wood, 1900), ZPAL G.44/41, depth 892.2 m; Lobograptus scanicus Biozone. O. Pristiograptus dubius postmagnus subsp. nov., ZPAL G.44/50, depth 780.5 m; Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) acer Biozone. P. Pristiograptus dubius welchae Rickards, 1965, ZPAL G.44/47, depth 836.6 m; Saetograptus leintwardinensis Biozone. Q. Pristiograptus dubius labiatus Urbanek, 1997, ZPAL G.44/55, depth 753.3 m; Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) spineus-Nocolonograptus parultimus Interzone.



main. As defined by phylogenetic systematics, such domains are characterized by a proximity of their common ancestry and by similar apomorphic tendencies within its taxa or clades. This is shown by abundant (rampant) parallelism which involves repeatedly evolving characters in our case e.g., bilateral apertural lobes. The capacity to develop synapomorphies (derived shared characters) called the underlying synapomorphy by Saether (1979, 1983) and Sluys (1989) may be considered one of the most characteristic features of evolution within a genealogical domain. The *P. dubius* group provides a graphic example of such capacity.

Morphological variation in Pristiograptus dubius group

There are two important characters for distinguishing forms of *Pristiograptus dubius* group (Fig. 3). One is the angle β between the thecal apertural lip and the succeeding meta-thecal wall (β -angle), in which the variations in the angle permits splitting *Pristiograptus* into two main gonujroups. Another important feature is the shape of thecal apertural lip and its location to the ventral wall of the succeeding theca (the end of thecal apertural lip). The thecal apertural lip is a thickening around the aperture and may be linked to the development of the ectocortex. The end of the thecal apertural lip is regarded herein as a lateral margin of the thecal aperture. Its location is a very important taxonomic feature in distinguishing forms of the *P. dubius* group.

Our descriptions of species and subspecies are based on isolated material. Some species of *P. dubius* morphotypes are described from isolated material for the first time. The specific features e.g., the position of the thecal aperture end in *P. dubius* morphotype species and subspecies have never been documented, except some Wenlock taxa of *P. dubius* morphotype (Radzevičius and Paškevičius 2000; Radzevičius 2003). Width of 3D rhabdosomes is different than in the flattened ones. The problem is that the description of majority species and subspecies of *P. dubius* morphotypes is based on flattened material what sometimes makes a difference comparing the description of 3D specimens. Thus the assignment of those isolated specimens to *P. dubius* morphotype species and subspecies is relative.

General features.—The widths of *P. dubius* morphotypes rhabdosomes vary, and the proximal end up to level of the fifth theca varies from straight to slightly ventrally curved. The rhabdosome widens gradually from 0.5 mm (e.g., *P. dubius shearsbyi* Rickards and Wright, 1999) to 0.8 mm (e.g., *P. sardous* [Gortani, 1922]), to 1.2 mm (e.g., *P. tumescens* [Wood, 1900]) at th⁵.

Thecae are simple and cylindrical (Fig. 5). Thecal spacing ranges from 9–12 in 10 mm, the numbers varying whether measured in the proximal, medial and distal parts of rhabdosome. The thecae are inclined at angle λ varying between 25–35° (Fig. 4). The first theca is 1–1.2 mm long and 0.3 mm wide.

The sicula may be straight or weakly ventrally curved (Fig. 6), and its length varies from 1.3 mm in *P. dubius parvus* to 2.2 mm in *P. dubius postmagnus* subsp. nov. The width of the sicular aperture ranges from 0.2 mm (e.g., *P. dubius parvus*) to, most commonly, 0.3 mm. The aperture of the sicula is concave in lateral view. The apex of the sicula reaches the base of th² or th³. The prosicula is 0.38–0.46 mm long. The metasicular length ranges from 1.41–1.48 mm. The width of the free part of sicula could be above 0.2 mm e.g., *P. dubius paezerensis* subsp. nov. (Fig. 6C, D, E).

The inclination of the thecal aperture to the sicular axis (angle β) ranges from oblique to a right angle e.g., *P. dubius praelodenicensis* subsp. nov. In most of the *P. dubius* group species, angle β is obtuse but may be a right angle in some forms e.g., *P. sardous*, *P. dubius praelodenicensis* subsp. nov., *P. dubius labiatus* Urbanek, 1997 and others (Fig. 5). The apertural lip can be narrow, or sometimes very thick as in *P. lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1943 (Fig. 5H).

The rim of the thecal lip may reach only as far as the middle part of the free ventral wall of the succeeding theca e.g., *P. dubius pseudodubius* (Bouček, 1932) (Fig. 5B), *P. dubius postfrequens* subsp. nov., or may be connected to the lip of

Fig. 6. SEM micrographs showing variations of proximal end in some graptolites *Pristiograptus* and *Colonograptus* forms. A, B. Zawada borehole, Poland. \rightarrow A. Pristiograptus dubius pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932), ZPAL G.44/2, depth 1584.9–1590.6 m; Cyrtograptus perneri Biozone. B. Pristiograptus sardous (Gortani, 1922), ZPAL G.44/8, depth 1590.6-1597.7 m; Cyrtograptus rigidus Biozone. C-E. Pristiograptus dubius paezerensis subsp. nov.; Cyrtograptus lundgreni Biozone. C. ZPAL G.44/17, Bartoszyce borehole, Poland, depth 1663.2 m. D. ZPAL G.44/10, Zawada borehole, Poland, depth 1546.5–1552.7 m. E. VU P.P222-216, Paežeriai-222 borehole, Lithuania, depth 734.5 m. F. Pristiograptus dubius praelodenicensis subsp. nov., ZPAL G.44/6, depth 1546.5–1552.7 m; Cyrtograptus lundgreni Biozone. G, H. Pristiograptus lodenicensis Přibyl, 1943, Zawada borehole, Poland; Cyrtograptus lundgreni Biozone. G. ZPAL G.44/14, depth 1546.5–1552.7 m. H. ZPAL G.44/19, depth 1555.9–1562 m. I-M. Pristiograptus virbalensis group; Colonograptus praedeubeli-C. deubeli biozones. I-L. Pristiograptus virbalensis Paškevičius, 1974. I-K. Sudkai-87 borehole. I. VU P.S87-121a, depth 768.2 m. J. VU P.S87-121b, depth 768.2 m. K. VU P.S87-382, abnormal virgella, depth 877 m. L. ZPAL G.44/27, Bartoszyce borehole, depth 1642.4 m. M. Pristiograptus auctus Rickards, 1965, VU P.S87-362, Sutkai-87 borehole, 768.2 m depth; Colonograptus deubeli Biozone. N. Pristiograptus dubius parvus Ulst, 1974, VU P.K14-109, Kybartai-14 borehole, Lithuania, depth 1088.4 m, Pristiograptus parvus Biozone; th¹ with sicula (N₁), enlargement of sicula aperture (N₂). O, P. Colonograptus praedeubeli (Jaeger, 1991); Colonograptus praedeubeli Biozone. O. ZPAL G.44/21, Bartoszyce IG-1 borehole, Poland, depth 1646 m. P. VU K.PS87-134, Sutkai-87 borehole, Lithuania, depth 776 m. Q. Colonograptus deubeli (Jaeger, 1959), VU S.S69-61, Šiupyliai-69 borehole, Lithuania, depth 983 m; Colonograptus deubeli Biozone. R. Pristiograptus dubius postfrequens subsp. nov., ZPAL G.44/37, Mielnik-1 borehole, Poland, depth 716.3 m; Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) spineus-Nocolonograptus parultimus Interzone. S. Pristiograptus dubius labiatus Urbanek, 1997, ZPAL G.44/52, Mielnik-1 borehole, Poland, depth 753.3 m; M. (U.) spineus-N. parultimus Interzone. T. Pristiograptus dubius welchae Rickards, 1965, ZPAL G.44/44, Mielnik-1 borehole, Poland, depth 836.6 m; Saetograptus leintwardinensis Biozone.



598

5C), *P. dubius postmagnus* subsp. nov. (Fig. 5O). The thecal lips can be simple e.g., *P. dubius dubius* (Fig. 5A), can have some depression e.g., *P. lodenicensis* (Fig. 5H) and made some intergrowth arch e.g., *Pristiograptus* sp. sensu Radzevičius 2003 (Fig. 5D).

Variation groups.—The investigation of all mentioned characters in *P. dubius* group permits the recognition of two main groups that differ in the angle β (Fig. 3) between the apertural margin of the theca and the succeeding thecal wall.

The first, and main, *P. dubius* group contains forms with an obtuse angle ß. This group consists of *P. dubius dubius* (Suess, 1851) (Fig. 7A), *P. dubius pseudodubius* (Bouček, 1932) (Fig. 7C, D), *P. dubius magnus* subsp. nov. (Fig. 7E, F), *P. dubius paezerensis* subsp. nov. (Figs. 8F–I, 9A, B), *Pristiograptus* sp. sensu Radzevičius 2003 (Fig. 7B), *P. dubius* Ulst, 1974 (Fig. 10C, D), *P. dubius frequens* Jaekel, 1889 (Fig. 11A–C, F–H), *P. dubius* aff. welshae Rickards, 1965 (Fig. 12H–K), *P. dubius postmagnus* subsp. nov. (Fig. 13A–C), *P. dubius postfrequens* subsp. nov. (Fig. 11J, L), *P. dubius shearsbyi* Rickards and Wright, 1999 (Fig. 11D, E, I, K).

The second *P. dubius* group is characterized by possessing a right or acute angle ß. The species diversity is smaller, comprising only five forms: *P. sardous* (Gortani, 1922) (Fig. 8B, D), *P. dubius praelodenicensis* subsp. nov. (Fig. 8A, C, E), *P. tumescens* (Wood, 1900) (Fig. 12A–F), *P. dubius labiatus* Urbanek, 1997 (Fig. 13D–F), and *P. lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1943 (Fig. 10).

Other differences between the two main groups include the shape of the apertural lips, differences in rhabdosome shape and size, and a different number of sicular rings (annuli). Ludfordian species display sicula with a fixed 3-ring pattern (Urbanek 1997).

Material and methods

The Wenlock and Ludlow material described herein was derived from the East European Platform of Poland and Lithuania (Fig. 2). Our study is based on 3D specimens studied on light microscope and scanning electron microscope (SEM). Some characters are recognisable on well preserved flatten material (Fig. 3B–E). The Wenlock pristiograptids were recovered from boreholes Zawada IG-1 and Bartoszyce IG-1 of Poland, and Kurtuvėnai-161, Šiupyliai-69, Paežeriai-222, Likënai-396, and Parovėja-9 boreholes of Lithuania. The Ludlow material was collected from the Mielnik IG-1 borehole, Baltic erratic boulders from Jarosławiec of Poland, and the Milaičiai-103 borehole of Lithuania. The rocks were dissolved in 5–10% hydrochloric acid using standard techniques for graptolites. A fine hairbrush was used to pick and transfer specimens. The recovered material is stored in glycerine or on the SEM stubs in the Institute of Palaeobiology Polish Academy of Sciences, Warsaw, Poland (ZPAL G.), and in Vilnius University, Geological Museum, Lithuania. Photographs were made utilizing the SEM in the Geological Museum of Denmark, Copenhagen, and ZPAL.

Systematic palaeontology

Order Graptoloidea Lapworth, 1873 Family Monograptidae Lapworth, 1873 Subfamily Pristiograptinae Gürich, 1908

Genus Pristiograptus Jaekel, 1889

Type species: Pristiograptus frequens Jaekel, 1889, erratic boulders, North Germany, *Lobograptus scanicus* Biozone, Lower Ludlow.

Diagnosis.—Rhabdosome of variable length and curvature but usually almost straight; thecae are straight, simple tubes throughout length of rhabdosome, thecae have varying degrees of overlap and inclination; sicula small to large.

Remarks.—Pristiograptus rhabdosomes have a large variation of characters, that consequently gives a large "number" of species and subspecies.

Pristiograptus dubius dubius (Suess, 1851)

Figs. 5A, 7A.

- 1851 Graptolithus dubius sp. nov.; Suess 1851: 115, pl. 9: 5a, b.
- 1913 *Monograptus dubius* (Suess, 1850); Elles and Wood 1913: 376– 378, text-fig. 247a, b.
- 1943 *Pristiograptus dubius dubius* (Suess, 1850); Přibyl 1943: 3–4, pl. 1: 4–6.
- 1952 Pristiograptus dubius dubius (Suess, 1850); Münch 1952: 85, pl. 18: 1.
- 1958 Pristiograptus dubius dubius (Suess, 1850); Přibyl 1958: 117.
- 2000 Pristiograptus dubius dubius (Suess, 1850); Radzevičius and Paškevičius 2000: 91–92, pl. 1: 2.

Material.—Ten fragments of rhabdosomes of different preservation from the Kurtuvėnai-161 (1420.5–1396.9 m) and Parovėja-9 boreholes (651.3–638 m), Lithuania.

Description.—The β angle is obtuse. The thecal lips are distinct, not extending onto the ventral wall of the succeeding

Fig. 7. SEM micrographs of Sheinwoodian (Wenlock) graptolite *Pristiograptus* forms. **A**, **B**. Parovėja-9 borehole, Lithuania. **A**. *Pristiograptus dubius dubius* \rightarrow (Suess, 1851), VU S.P9-31, depth 644.8 m; *Monograptus riccartonensis* Biozone, general view of rhabdosome (A₁), th⁴ apertural lip (A₂), apex of sicula and first theca apertural lip (A₃), mouth of sicula and virgella (A₄). **B**. *Pristiograptus* sp. sensu Radzevičius, 2003, VU S.P9-219, depth 595.4 m; *Cyrtograptus perneri* Biozone, general view of rhabdosome (B₁), connection of thecal apertural lip with succeeding theca apertural lip (B₂), intergrowth arch of th¹ (B₃), and intergrowth arch of th³ (B₄), thick virgella and sicular apertural lip (B₅). **C**, **D**. *Pristiograptus dubius pseudodubius* (Bouček, 1932), Zawada borehole, Poland, depth 1584.9–1590.6 m; *Cyrtograptus perneri* Biozone. **C**. ZPAL G.44/1, general view of rhabdosome. **D**. ZPAL G.44/2, general view of rhabdosome (D₁), th⁵ apertural lip (D₂), and th¹ with sicula (D₃). **E**, **F**. *Pristiograptus dubius magnus* subsp. nov., Zawada borehole, Poland. **E**. ZPAL G.44/3, depth 1577.5–1582.5 m; *Cyrtograptus perneri* Biozone, general view of rhabdosome (E₁), th⁶ apertural lip (E₂), and th¹ with sicula (E₃). **F**. ZPAL G.44/4, depth 1590.6–1597.7 m, *Cyrtograptus rigidus* Biozone, general view of rhabdosome (F₁), th⁶ apertural lip (E₂), and th¹ with sicula (F₃).



thecae and ending in the beginning of the ventral wall (Figs. 5A, 7A). No sicular rings are observed.

Discussion.—The type material of the *P. dubius* (Suess, 1851) is flattened and poorly illustrated. It has never been redescribed and refigured. Details of the *P. dubius dubius* rhabdosome structures are not visible at the type material. The *P. dubius* morphotype is considered to be *P. dubius dubius* subspecies, which thecal apertural lip not extending onto the ventral wall of succeeding thecae and ending at the beginning of the ventral wall and without sicular rings.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Lower Wenlock Monograptus riccartonensis—M. antennularius Biozones. P. dubius dubius is widespread, having been recorded from all continents.

Pristiograptus dubius pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932) Figs. 5B, 6A, 7C, D.

- 1943 Pristiograptus pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932); Přibyl 1943: 8–9, pl. 1:. 1, 3.
- 1952 Pristiograptus pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932); Münch 1952: 86, pl. 18: 7.
- 1965 *Pristiograptus pseudodubius* (Bouček, 1932); Obut et al. 1965: 72, pl. 13: 2.
- 1965 Pristiograptus pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932); Rickards 1965: 260, pl. 29: 10, text-fig. 2I.
- 1967 *Pristiograptus pseudodubius* (Bouček, 1932); Gailite et al. 1967: 243–244, pl. 18: 8, 9, text-fig. 57.
- 1974 Pristiograptus pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932); Ulst 1974: 108– 109, pl. 11: 1, pl. 12: 1, 2.
- 2000 Pristiograptus pseudodubius (Bouček, 1932); Radzevičius and Paškevičius 2000: 92–94, pl. 2: 1.

Material.— More then 200 rhabdosomes and fragments from Kurtuvėnai-161 (1351.9–1328.1 m), Likënai-369 (630.0–582.1 m), and Parovėja-9 (621.5–588.6 m) boreholes, Lithuania and Zawada-1 borehole (1590.65–1584.9 m), Poland.

Description.—The β angle is obtuse. The thecal apertural lip reaches only the middle of the free ventral wall of the succeeding theca (Figs. 5B, 7C, D). No sicular rings are observed.

Discussion.—The type material of *P. dubius pseudodubius* has been described from flattened material and detailed account of the structures of its rhabdosome are not visible. In this work *P. dubius pseudodubius* is considered to be as *dubius* morphotype with β angle obtuse, which the apertural lip reaches only the middle of the free ventral wall of the succeeding theca.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Wenlock Monograp-

tus belophorus–Cyrtograptus lundgreni Biozones; *P. dubius pseudodubius* is widespread, known from all continents.

Pristiograptus dubius parvus Ulst, 1974

Figs. 5J, 6H, 10C, D.

- 1974 *Pristiograptus parvus* sp. nov.; Ulst 1974: 111–113, pl. 12: 43, pl. 11 : 5.
- 1991 Pristiograptus dubius parvus Ulst, 1974; Jaeger 1991: 316–318, pl. 25: 2–6, 8.
- 1996 Pristiograptus dubius "parvus" Ulst, 1974; Gutierrez-Marco et al. 1996: 660, pl. 1: 1–3.
- 1998 Pristiograptus parvus Ulst, 1974; Kozłowska-Dawidziuk et al. 1998: 99, pl. 1G.
- 1999 Pristiograptus parvus Ulst, 1974; Kozłowska-Dawidziuk 1999: 356, fig. 3a.
- 2000 Pristiograptus parvus Ulst, 1974; Radzevičius and Paškevičius 2000: 95–96, pl. II: 2, 3; pl. VI: F.
- 2001 Pristiograptus parvus Ulst, 1974; Kozłowska-Dawidziuk et al. 2001: 159–161, fig. 8: 11–13, fig. 9: 6–8.
- 2004 *Pristiograptus parvus* Ulst, 1974; Porębska et al. 2004: 276, fig. 3R.
- 2010 *Pristiograptus parvus* Ulst, 1974; Radzevičius et al. 2010: 56, fig. 3B, D.

Material.—About 100 rhabdosomes and fragments from the Kurtuvėnai-161 (1323.2–1321.1 m), Parovėja-9538 m), Šiupyliai-69 (1004–1000.8 m) boreholes, Lithuania and Bartoszyce IG-1 borehole (1660–1657.8 m), Poland.

Description.—The rhabdosome is straight, sometimes slightly curved to the ventral side, the β angle is obtuse (Fig. 5J). The first theca begins at the level of the sicula aperture (Fig. 6H). *P. parvus* is like a small version of *P. dubius pseudodubius*.

Discussion.—The type of *P. parvus* Ulst, 1974 was described using non-isolated, flattened material. This species is specific having very small rhabdosome.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—*P. parvus* Biozone, East European Platform (Poland, Latvia, Lithuania, Sweden), Czech Republic, Germany, Spain, Canada.

Pristiograptus dubius frequens Jaekel, 1889

Figs. 5M, 11A-C, F-H.

- 1943 Pristiograptus frequens Jaekel, 1889; Přibyl 1943: 24–25, pl. 3:13, text-fig 3A.
- 1991 Monograptus dubius frequens (Jaekel, 1889); Jaeger 1991: 314, fig. 25: 9, 11, 15.

Material.---More then 50 rhabdosomes and fragments from

Fig. 8. SEM micrographs of Sheinwoodian and Homerian (Wenlock) graptolite *Pristiograptus* forms. **A**, **C**, **E**. *Pristiograptus dubius praelodenicensis* \rightarrow subsp. nov., Zawada borehole, Poland, depth 1546.5–1552.7 m; *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone. **A**. Holotype, ZPAL G.44/5, general view of rhabdosome (A₁), proximal part of rhabdosome (A₂), the end of th 2 apertural lip (A₃), and aperture of sicula (A₄). **C**. ZPAL G.44/6, general view of rhabdosome (C₁), th³ and th⁴ apertures (C₂), and sicula with th¹ (C₃). **E**. ZPAL G.44/7, young rhabdosome. **B**, **D**. *Pristiograptus sardous* (Gortani, 1922), Zawada borehole, Poland, depth 1590.6–1597.7 m; *Cyrtograptus rigidus* Biozone. **B**. ZPAL G.44/8, general view of rhabdosome (B₁) and th⁶ lip (B₂). **D**. ZPAL G.44/9, general view of rhabdosome. **F**–**I**. *Pristiograptus dubius paezerensis* subsp. nov.; *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone. **F**, **G**, **I**. Zawada borehole, Poland. **F**, **G**. Depth 1546.5–1552.7 m. **F**. ZPAL G.44/10, general view or rhabdosome (F₁), enlargement with the end of th² lip (F₂). **G**. ZPAL G.44/11, general view of rhabdosome (G₁) and sicula with long virgella (G₂). **I**. ZPAL G.44/12, depth 1555.9–1562 m, general view of rhabdosome. **H**. VU P.P222-216, Paežeriai-222 borehole, Lithuania, depth 734.5 m, general view of proximal part of a rhabdosome (H₁), th⁵ lip (H₂), end of the th² lip (H₃), and sicular aperture with dorsal process and long virgella (H₄).

600



ACTA PALAEONTOLOGICA POLONICA 57 (3), 2012



Fig. 9. SEM micrographs of the graptolite *Pristiograptus lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1943; *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone, Lower Homerian, Wenlock. **A–D**, **F**. Zawada borehole, Poland. **A–C**. Depth 1546.5–1552.7 m. **A**. ZPAL G. 44/13, general view of rhabdosome (A₁), lips of th³ and th⁴ (A₂), and th¹ with sicula (A₃). **B**. ZPAL G.44/14, general view of dorsal side of rhabdosome (B₁), proximal end (B₂). **C**. ZPAL G.44/15, general view of rhabdosome. **D**, **F**. Depth 1540–1546.5 m. **D**. ZPAL G.44/16, proximal end of rhabdosome. **F**. ZPAL G.44/17, proximal end of rhabdosome (F₁) and th² lip with cortical tissue "script" ("manta ray wing") (F₂). **E**. VU P.P9-4b, Parovėja-9 borehole, Lithuania, depth 561.9 m, general view of rhabdosome (E₁), depressions of thecal apertural lip (E₂).

erratic boulder (S36), Poland and Šiupyliai-69 (994.2–905.5 m), Kurtuvėnai-161 (1297.1–127.2 m) boreholes, Lithuania.

Description.—The rhabdosome is narrow and graceful. The proximal end is slightly curved ventrally as far th⁵. The ß angle is obtuse. The thecal apertural lip is distinct, not extend-

ing onto the ventral wall of the succeeding theca and ending in the beginning of the ventral wall. The number of sicular rings varies from 3 to 8 (Fig. 11A, B).

Remarks.—The genus *Pristiograptus* was erected by Jaekel (1889), designating *P. frequens* as its type species. Recent

studies reveal that the differences between *P. frequens* and *P. dubius* (Suess, 1851) are so small, that the former species should be considered as a subspecies of the last mentioned, and earlier established, species by Suess (1851) [compare Jaeger 1991, who used the name *Monograptus dubius frequens* (Jaekel, 1889)]. The difference between *P. dubius dubius* and *P. dubius frequens* is in absence of sicular rings in *P. dubius dubius* and their presence in *P. dubius frequens*.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Colonograptus praedeubeli–Cucullograptus hemiaversus Biozone. P. dubius frequens having been recorded from: Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Czech Republic, and Germany.

Pristiograptus dubius postfrequens subsp. nov.

Figs. 6P, 11J, L.

Etymology: From Latin *post*, after; *frequens*, frequent.

Holotype: ZPAL G./24, isolated rhabdosome with sicula and thee thecae illustrated in Urbanek 1997: fig. 43D.

Type locality: Mielnik-1 borehole, depth 786.5 m, Poland.

Type horizon: Upper Ludlow, *Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) acer* Biozone.

Material.—About 50 rhabdosomes and some fragments from Mielnik-1 borehole (915–690 m), Poland and Milaičiai-103 borehole (1255–1210 m), Lithuania.

Diagnosis.—Thecal lip ends in the middle or above the free ventral wall of the succeeding theca. Sicula with three rings.

Description.—The rhabdosome is narrow and slightly curved ventrally at the proximal end. The rhabdosome widens gradually from 0.6 mm at th¹, to 0.7 mm at th², 0.8 mm at th³. Interapertural width is 0.5 mm at th¹, 0.6 mm at th², 0.7 mm at th³. There are 10–12 thecae in 10 mm. The ß angle is obtuse. Th¹ is 0.9 mm long and 0.3 mm wide. The free part of each theca is half of its whole length. The end of the thecal lip may continue up to the half length of the free part of succeeding thecae or above. The λ angle is 30°. Sicula length is 2.2 mm and width is 0.3 mm. The apex of the sicula reaches the base of th³. There are three sicular rings.

Discussion.—P. dubius postfrequens is similar to *P. dubius frequens*. The difference is in the number of sicula rings and in the position of the thecal apertural end. *P. dubius post-frequens* has fixed 3 sicular rings whereas in *P. dubius frequents* the number of sicular rings vary from 3 to 8. The end of the thecal lip of *P. dubius postfrequens* may continue up to the half length of the free part of succeeding theca or above, whereas the thecal apertural lip of *P. dubius frequens* is ending at the beginning of the ventral wall of succeeding theca.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Saetograptus leintwardinensis–Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) spineus Biozone, Poland and Lithuania.

Pristiograptus dubius magnus subsp. nov.

Figs. 5C, 7E, F.

2003 Pristiograptus dubius var. "A"; Radzevičius 2003: 6–7, figs. 5–7.
2008 Pristiograptus dubius var. A Radzevičius, 2003; Radzevičius et al. 2008: 38, fig. 4C.



Fig. 10. SEM micrographs of two Homerian (Wenlock) graptolite *Pristiograptus* forms. **A**, **B**. *Pristiograptus dubius paezerensis* subsp. nov., mature rhabdosomes; *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone. **A**. ZPAL G.44/17, Bartoszyce IG-1 borehole, Poland, depth 1663.2 m. **B**. ZPAL G.44/19, Zawada borehole, Poland, depth 1555.9–1562 m. **C**, **D**. *Pristiograptus dubius parvus* Ulst, 1974 growing rhabdosomes, Bartoszyce IG-1 borehole, Poland, depth 1660.7 m; *Pristiograptus parvus* Biozone. **C**. ZPAL G.44/25. **D**. ZPAL G.44/26.

2010 Pristiograptus dubius var. A sensu Radzevičius, 2003: Loydell et al. 2010: 256, fig. 3s, t.

Etymology: From Latin magnus, great, grand.

Holotype: VU-9-220, isolated rhabdosome with with sicula and 11 thecae illustrated in Radzevičius 2003: fig. 5A.

Type locality: Parovėja-9 borehole, depth 605.25 m, Lithuania.

Type horizon: Lower Wenlock, C. perneri Biozone.

Material.—About 25 rhabdosomes and additional fragments from the Parovėja-9 borehole (605.25–590.5 m), Lithuania, depth and Zawada-1 borehole (1577.5–1582.5 m), Poland.

Diagnosis.—Thecal lips distinct and connected with those of succeeding thecae. No sicular rings.

Description.—The rhabdosome is robust and straight, although some specimens show ventral curvature proximally. L is >11.5 mm. The rhabdosome widens gradually from 0.8 mm at th¹, to 0.9 mm at th², 1 mm at th³, and 1.2 mm at th⁴. W_{max} is 1.7 mm. The interapertural W is 0.55 mm at th¹, 0.65 mm at th², 0.85 mm at th³, 0.95 mm at th⁴, and 1.05 mm at th⁵. There are 10–11 thecae in 10 mm. The ß angle is obtuse. Th¹ is 1 mm long. The free part of each theca is half of its whole length. The thecal lips are distinct and connected with that of the succeeding thecae, except th¹ and th² although it may have been obscured in these thecae by overgrowth of cortical tissue. The lip connection is particularly distinctive in the medial and distal parts of the rhabdosome. The λ angle is 30°. The sicula is short and narrow, L is 1.8 mm and apertural W is 0.3 mm. The apex of the sicula reaches the base of th³. The free part of the sicula is 0.3 mm long. The virgella is short, up to 0.6 mm. In one specimen there is a thickened protrusion in the middle part of the virgella. No sicular rings are observed.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Lower Wenlock, *C. perneri* Biozone, Poland and Lithuania.

Pristiograptus dubius paezerensis subsp. nov.

Figs. 5F, G, 6C, D, E, 8F–I, 9A, B.

2003 Pristiograptus dubius var. B; Radzevičius 2003: 7–8, figs. 8, 9. 2006 Pristiograptus dubius var. B; Radzevičius 2006: 337, fig. 4B. Etymology: After Paežeriai village and borehole in Lithuania.

Holotype: VU-222-229, isolated rhabdosome with with sicula and five thecae illustrated in Radzevičius 2003: fig. 8A.

Type locality: Paežeriai-222 borehole, depth 730 m, Lithuania.

Type horizon: Upper Wenlock, C. lundgreni Biozone.

Material.—About 20 rhabdosomes and many fragments from boreholes: Paežeriai-222 (734.5–730 m), Likënai-369 (577–605.9 m), Šiupyliai-69 (1007 m) boreholes, Lithuania and Zawada-1 (1546.5–1552.7 m), Bartoszyce IG-1 (1665.3–1663.2 m) boreholes, Poland.

Diagnosis.—Thecal lip distinct, extending onto the ventral wall of the succeeding theca up to the middle of the ventral wall, not reaching its apertural lip. First theca starts 0.3 mm above the sicular aperture. Long virgella. No sicular rings.

Description.—The rhabdosome is straight and narrow, L is >12.5 mm, W is 0.7 mm at th¹, 0.75 mm at th², 0.85 mm at th³, 0.95 mm at th⁴, and 1mm at th⁵. W_{max} is 1.1 mm on th⁶. The interapertural W is 0.5 mm at th¹, 0.6 mm at th², 0.75 mm at th³, 0.8 mm at th⁴, and 0.9 mm at th⁵. There are 10–11 thecae in 10 mm. Thecae are cylindrical. The angle β is obtuse. The free part of each theca is half of its entire length. The thecal lip is distinct, the end of thecal lip may continue up to the half length of the free part of succeeding thecae. The λ angle is 30°. The sicula L is 2 mm, apertural W is 0.35 mm. The apex of the sicula is at approximately at the level of the apertural lip of th². Th¹ arises 0.3 mm above the sicular aperture. The virgella is thin, L to 1.35 mm.

Remarks.—The thecal apertural lips are thick and distinctive and interthecal septa of astogenetically old rhabdosomes are very thick (Fig. 10A, B).

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Upper Wenlock, *C. lundgreni* Biozone; Poland and Lithuania.

Pristiograptus sp. sensu Radzevičius, 2003 Figs. 5D, 7B.

2003 Pristiograptus sp.; Radzevičius 2003: 8-9, fig. 10.

Material.—One specimen, VU-9-219, from the Parovėja-9 borehole (595.4 m), Lithuania; rhabdosome with first 8 thecae and sicula.

Remarks.—The thecal lip is distinct, extending over the free part of the succeeding theca and additionally its ends are connected (Fig. 5D). This connection is clearly visible in the medial and distal parts of the rhabdosome. Th¹ and th² either do not have such thecal apertural lip connections or they are covered by cortical tissue. The lips of the distal thecae are bifurcated. An intergrowth arch is well developed especially in the proximal part of the rhabdosome. The distance between the thecal apertural lip connection on the succeeding theca and the origin of its bifurcation is 0.25 mm for th¹ and th², and 0.35 mm for th³ to th⁵. There are no sicular rings.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Wenlock, *C. perneri* Biozone, Lithuania.

Pristiograptus sardous (Gortani, 1922)

Figs. 5E, 6B, 8B, D.

- 1943 Pristiograptus sardous sardous (Gortani, 1922); Přibyl 1943: 14–15, pl. 1: 3, text-fig. 2C.
- 1943 Monograptus sardous Gortani, 1922; Přibyl 1943: pl. 8: 1, textfig. 9.
- 1952 *Pristiograptus sardous* (Gortani, 1922); Münch 1952: 86, pl. 18: 10.

Material.—About 5 rhabdosomes from Zawada-1 borehole (1590.6–1597.7 m), Poland.

Description.—The apertural lips of symmetrically flattened thecae form an acute or right β angle. Overall, thecal apertures are perpendicular to the rhabdosome axis in the medial and distal parts of the rhabdosome. The λ angle is 30°. There are no sicular rings.

Discussion.—The type material of *P. sardous* is flattened. *P. sardous* is *P. dubius* type *Pristiograptus* with wide proximal end of rhabdosome.

Fig. 11. SEM micrographs showing variations of proximal end of rhabdosomes in three *Pristiograptus dubius* subspecies of graptolites. A–C, F–H. *Pristiograptus dubius frequens* Jaekel, 1889, Baltic erratic boulder S36, Gdańsk, Poland; *Lobograptus scanicus* Biozone. A. ZPAL G.44/28, general view of rhabdosome (A₁) and proximal end (A₂). B. ZPAL G.44/29, lateral view of rhabdosome. C. ZPAL G.44/30, general view of rhabdosome. F. ZPAL G.44/31, proximal end of rhabdosome with sicular rings. G. ZPAL G.44/32, general view of rhabdosome (G₁) and proximal end (G₂). H. ZPAL G.44/33, ventral view of young rhabdosome. D, E, I, K. *Pristiograptus dubius shearsbyi* Rickards and Wright, 1999, Mielnik borehole, Poland, depth 688.8 m; *Neocolonograptus parultimus* Interzone. D. ZPAL G.44/27, proximal end of rhabdosome (D₂) and general view of rhabdosome (D₁). E. ZPAL G.44/34, general view of rhabdosome (E₁) and proximal end of rhabdosome (E₂). I. ZPAL G.44/35, lateral view of medial part of rhabdosome (I₁) ventral view (I₂). K. ZPAL G.44/36, general view of rhabdosome (K₁) and sicula with two first thecae (K₂). J. L. *Pristiograptus dubius postfrequens* subsp. nov., Mielnik borehole, Poland; *Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) spineus–Neocolonograptus parultimus* Interzone. J. ZPAL G.44/37, depth 716.3 m, general view of rhabdosome (J₁) and proximal end of rhabdosome (J₂). L. ZPAL G.44/38, depth 715.6 m, lateral view of young rhabdosome (L₁), and proximal end (L₂).



Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Wenlock Cyrtograptus rigidus, Cyrtograptus perneri biozones; Poland, Czech Republic, Italy.

Pristiograptus dubius praelodenicensis subsp. nov. Figs. 5I, 6F, 8A, C, E.

Etymology: From Latin *prae*, before; supposedly *P. dubius praelodenicensis* is the ancestor of *P. lodenicensis*.

Holotype: ZPAL G.44/5, isolated rhabdosome with sicula and 6 thecae, Fig. 8A.

Type locality: Zawada IG-1 borehole, depth 1546.5–1552.7 m, Poland. *Type horizon*: Upper Wenlock, *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone.

Material.—About 25 rhabdosomes and many fragments from Zawada IG-1 borehole (1546.5–1552.7 m), Poland.

Diagnosis.— β angle acute. The cal lips straight and perpendicular to the rhabdosome axis. No sicula rings.

Description.—The rhabdosome is narrow, the proximal end is slightly curved ventrally up to th⁴ or th⁵. L is more than 30 mm. W is 0.7 mm at th¹, 0.85 mm at th², 1 mm at th³, 1.2 mm at th⁴, and 1.2 mm at th⁵ level. W_{max} is usually 1.5 mm. The interapertural W is 0.65 mm at th¹, 0.7 mm at th², 0.8.5 mm at th³, 0.9 mm at th⁴, and 1 mm at th⁵. The ß angle is acute. The thecae are uniform. Thecal lips are perpendicular to the rhabdosomal axis. The th¹ L is 0.9–1 mm, W is 0.3 mm and overlaps th² for 1/3 to 1/2 of its length. The λ angle is 29–32°. The sicula is slightly curved ventrally, L is 1.5–2.0 mm, and W 0.25–0.3 mm at apertural level. The sicular apex is on a level between the middle and the top of th². No sicula rings.

Discussion.—*P. dubius praelodenicensis* subsp. nov. is similar to *P. lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1943 in having an acute to right β angle.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Upper Wenlock, *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone, Poland.

Pristiograptus lodenicensis Přibyl, 1943

Figs. 4B, 5H, 6G, 10.

- 1943 *Pristiograptus lodenicensis* sp. nov.; Přibyl 1943: 23–24, textfigs. C, D, J, K; pl. 3: 8–11.
- 1952 Pristiograptus lodenicensis Přibyl, 1943; Münch 1952: 91, pl. 20: 7.
- 1967 *Pristiograptus lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1943; Gailite et al. 1967: 244, text-fig. 58; pl. 29: 4, 5.
- 1974 *Pristiograptus lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1943; Ulst 1974: 115, pl. 13: 1, 2a, b, pl. 11: 7.
- 2000 Pristiograptus lodenicensis Přibyl, 1943; Radzevičius and Paškevičius 2000: 97–98, pl. 4: 1a–c, 2a–c, pl. 6D.
- 2003 Pristiograptus lodenicensis Přibyl, 1943; Radzevičius 2003: 10– 11, figs. 11A–H, 12A–F.

- 2005 Pristiograptus lodenicensis Přibyl, 1943; Radzevičius and Paškevičius 2005: 165, pl. 2: F.
- 2006 *Pristiograptus lodenicensis* Přibyl, 1943; Radzevičius 2006: 337, fig. 4C–F.

Remarks.-The thecae are slightly curved, and widen towards their apertures. The β angle is acute, and the λ angle is right. The thecal lips are symmetrically curved (Fig. 9A, E). The depressions and curvature of lips are variable in proximal and distal thecae. The lips maybe slightly or much curved, they may widen towards their ends, and may have small or large ventral incisions and curvatures close to their ends. In some specimens there are large symmetrical "stingray wing" structures located at the ends of lips (Fig. 9F). These structures may occur in a few thecae or all the thecae (Radzevičius 2006: fig. 4c-f). The thecal apertures are right angles to the rhabdosome axis. Similar thecae occur in P. d. labiatus, thus both forms are not typical members of P. dubius group. This type of theca is similar to those of Istrograptus Tsegelniuk, 1976 and Neocolonograptus Urbanek, 1997. This species is separated from the lodenicencis group (Radzevičius and Paškevičius 2000).

P. praelodenicensis is very similar to *P. lodenicensis* with thecae slightly curved, widening towards the aperture, which shows a small ventral depression. Thecae of *P. praelodenicensis* do not have such kind of depression.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Upper Wenlock *Cyrtograptus lundgreni* Biozone; Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Czech Republic.

Pristiograptus tumescens (Wood, 1900)

Figs. 5N, 12A-F.

- 1916 *Monograptus tumescens* Wood, 1900; Elles and Wood 1910: 379–380, pl. 38: 12a–d.
- 1943b Pristiograptus tumescens tumescens (Wood, 1900); Přibyl 1943: 18–19.

Material.—More then 50 rhabdosomes and rhabdosomes fragments from Mielnik-1 borehole (976–896 m), Poland and Milaičiai-103 borehole (1269–1259 m), Lithuania.

Description.—The β angle is obtuse or right. The thecal apertural lip reaches the middle part or above of the free ventral wall of the succeeding theca. The sicula has rings.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Ludlow Cucullograptus hemiaversus, Saetograptus leintwardinensis Biozones, East European Platform (Latvia, Lithuania, Poland), Czech Republic, Great Britain.

Fig. 12. SEM micrographs of graptolites *Pristiograptus tumescens* (Wood, 1900) and *P. dubius welchae* Rickards, 1965. A–F. *Pristiograptus tumescens* \rightarrow (Wood, 1900). A–C, F. Mielnik borehole, Poland. A–C. Depth 892.2 m; *Lobograptus scanicus* Biozone. A. ZPAL G.44/39, lateral view of rhabdosome. B. ZPAL G.44/40, whole rhabdosome (B₁), enlargement of th³ lip (B₂), sicula with th¹ (B₃). C. ZPAL G.44/41, medial part of rhabdosome. F. ZPAL G.44/42, general view of rhabdosome. D, E. Milaičiai-103 borehole, Lithuania, depth 11267.5 m. D. VU S.M103-21X, lateral view of rhabdosome. E. VU S.M103-22X, lateral view of rhabdosome. G–K. *Pristiograptus dubius welchae* Rickards, 1965, Mielnik borehole, Poland, depth 836.6 m; *Saetograptus leintwardinensis* Biozone. G. ZPAL G.44/43, lateral view of rhabdosome (G₁) and sicula with th¹ (G₂). H. ZPAL G.44/44, young rhabdosome (H₁), sicula (H₂). I. ZPAL G.44/45, lateral view of rhabdosome (K₁), th³ (K₂), and sicula with th¹ (K₃).



http://dx.doi.org/10.4202/app.2010.0070

Pristiograptus dubius welchae Rickards, 1965 Figs. 5P, 6O, 12G-K.

1965 Pristiograptus welchae sp. nov.; Rickards 1965: 261, pl. 30: 6; text-fig. 2f.

Material.-About 20 rhabdosomes and rhabdosomes fragments from Mielnik-1 borehole (836.6 m), Poland.

Description.—The rhabdosome is very small, up to 5 mm long, narrow 0.7–1.2 mm, and slightly curved to the ventral side, sometimes straight. The ß angle is obtuse or right. The thecal lip is distinct, ending at the beginning of the free ventral wall of succeeding theca. The sicula has three rings.

Remark.—The P. dubius welchae is very similar to the Wenlock species P. dubius parvus, although P. dubius parvus does not have sicular rings.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Saetograptus leintwardinensis-Neocucullograptus kozlowskii Biozone, Poland; Neodiversograptus nilssoni-Lobograptus scanicus and S. leintwardinensis biozones of North England (Rickards 1965).

Pristiograptus dubius labiatus Urbanek, 1997 Figs. 5R, 6T, 13D–F.

1997 Pristiograptus dubius labiatus subsp. nov.; Urbanek 1997: 160-161, pl. 16: 1-11, text-fig. 44A-D.

Material.-20 rhabdosomes and many from Mielnik borehole (761.75-727.7 m), Poland.

Remarks.—The ß angle is acute and the thecal apertural lip is at a right angle to rhabdosomal axis. The thecal lip is distinct with an incision in its ventral side, similar to P. lodenicensis (Fig. 5H). The sicula has three rings.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—Monograptus (Slovinograptus) balticus-M. (Uncinatograptus) spineus Biozone, Upper Ludlow, Poland.

Pristiograptus dubius postmagnus subsp. nov. Figs. 50, 13A-C.

Etymology: From Latin post, after; magnus, great, large.

Holotype: ZPAL G.44/48, rhabdosome with sicula and seven thecae, Fig. 13.

Type locality: Mielnik-1 borehole, depth 780.5 m, Poland.

Type horizon: Upper Ludlow, M. (U.) acer Biozone.

Material.-15 rhabdosomes and many fragments from Mielnik borehole (780.5 m), Poland.

Diagnosis.-Distinct thecal lips connecting with those of the succeeding thecae. Sicula with three rings.

Description.—The rhabdosome is robust and the proximal end is slightly curved ventrally up to th⁵. The longest rhabdosome L is more than 15 mm long. The rhabdosome W from 0.65 mm at th¹, to 0.8 mm at th², 9 mm at th³, 1 mm at th⁴, 1.1 mm at th⁵, 1.2 mm at th⁶. The W_{max} is 1.3 mm. The interapertural width is 0.55 mm at th¹, 0.65 mm at th², 0.75 mm at th³, 0.8 mm at th⁴, and 0.9 mm at th⁵. There are 10–11 thecae in 10 mm. The β angle is obtuse. Th¹ is 1mm long and 0.3

mm wide. The free part of each theca is half of its whole length. The thecal lips are distinct and connected with the lip of the succeeding thecae (Figs. 5O, 13A-C). The lip connection is particularly well developed in the medial and distal parts of the rhabdosome. The λ angle is 30°. The sicula is short and narrow. Its L is 1.8 mm and apertural W is 0.3 mm. The apex of the sicula reaches the base of th³. The sicula has three rings. The virgella is short, up to 0.5 mm.

Remarks.—*P. dubius postmagnus* subsp. nov. is similar to *P.* dubius magnus subsp. nov., in the connection of the lip with the succeeding thecal lip. In contrast to P. dubius magnus subsp. nov. it has sicular rings.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—M. (U.) acer Biozone, Upper Ludlow, Poland.

Pristiograptus dubius shearsbyi Rickards and Wright, 1999

Fig. 11D, E, I, K.

1999 Pristiograptus dubius shearsbyi sp. nov.; Rickards and Wright 1999: 194, figs. 3J-P, 11A, B, 13B, E.

Material.—10 rhabdosomes, Mielnik-1 borehole (688.8 m), Poland.

Description.—The rhabdosome is narrow and proximally is either slightly curved ventrally or straight. The β angle is obtuse. The thecal lips are distinct, not extending onto the free ventral wall of the succeeding thecae. The λ angle is 25°. The sicula L is 2 mm and W is 0.3 mm. The sicula has three rings.

Stratigraphic and geographic range.—M. (U.) spineus–Neocolonograptus parultimus Interzone, Australia and Poland.

Conclusions

The detailed investigation in SEM of three-dimensionally preserved Silurian graptolites chemically isolated from host rocks provides numerous new morphological information. This throws a new light on pattern of evolution of the longest ranging monograptid Pristiograptus dubius (Suess, 1851) and a number of closely related taxa, forming the P. dubius group taxa. The studied fauna comes mainly from boreholes of Poland and Lithuania which permits to trace their changes in a stratigraphic interval from Monograptus riccartonensis to Neocolonograptus ultimus Biozone.

The P. dubius group taxa is divided into two morphological groups differing in the angle between the thecal lip and the succeeding thecal wall, namely into the group with obtuse and acute angle. The P. dubius stem lineage taxa forming an unbroken sequence of closely related subspecies and displaying only minor morphological changes through time all belong to the first and main morphological group. These taxa represent a graphic example of phyletic evolution. The second morphological group is composed of iterative P.



Fig. 13. SEM micrographs of Ludfordian graptolites *Pristiograptus dubius postmagnus* subsp. nov. and *Pristiograptus dubius labiatus* Urbanek, 1997. A–C. *Pristiograptus dubius postmagnus* subsp. nov., Mielnik-1 borehole, Poland, depth 780.5 m; *Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) acer* Biozone. A. ZPAL G.44/48, lateral view of rhabdosome (A₁), the thecal lip with connection to the succeeding theca (A₂), and proximal end of rhabdosome (A₃). B. ZPAL G.44/49, lateral view of rhabdosome sicula with rings (B₁) and proximal end of rhabdosome (B₂). C. ZPAL G.44/50, medial part of rhabdosome (C₂), enlargements showing connections to the succeeding theca (C₁, C₃). D–F. *Pristiograptus dubius labiatus* Urbanek, 1997, Mielnik-1 borehole, Poland, depth 753.3 m; *Monograptus (Uncinatograptus) spineus–Neocolonograptus parultimus* Interzone. D. ZPAL G.44/51, general view of rhabdosome (D₁), sicula with two first thecae and depression on th¹ lip (D₂). E. ZPAL G.44/52, lateral view of rhabdosome (E₁) and proximal end of rhabdosome (E₂). F. ZPAL G.44/53, lateral view of rhabdosome (F₁) enlargement of proximal end (F₂).

dubius group taxa derived from the stem lineage by means of iterative speciation.

Examined phylogenetic relationship between fifteen species and subspecies derived from *P. dubius* reveals many examples of heterochronic parallelism which may indicate the preservation of evolutionary potential capable of multiple production of similar forms. The taxa give the stem lineage continuing at successive stratigraphic levels during the extremely long time span, approximately 18 Ma.

Significance of the presence of dwarfed form *P. dubius parvus*, the only monograptid taxon to appear immediately after the most severe extinction event in graptolite history,

610

the *C. lundgreni* Event is discussed. We advanced the hypothesis that this taxon in question appeared as result of the so-called Lilliput effect (defined by Urbanek 1993), and probably represents a geographically vicarious form of *P. dubius* with the normal rhabdosome size. Thus we consider *P. dubius parvus* provisionally as a link in the evolution of the stem lineage taxa.

Acknowledgements

This paper is dedicated to the memory of Professor Barrie Rickards, a distinguished graptolite worker. We thank paper reviewer Jan Zalasiewicz (University of Leicester, Leicester, UK) for his valuable comments. SR thanks the Science Council of Lithuania (No. MIP-034/2012), Synthesis and DK-TAF-2966. This paper is a contribution to the International Geoscience Programme (IGCP) Project 591—The Early to Middle Paleozoic Revolution.

References

- Bouček, B. 1932. Předbežna zpráwa o některých nových druzich graptolitu z českého gotlandienu. Věstnik Státního geologického ústavu Československé republiky 7: 150–155.
- Elles, G.L. and Wood, E.M. 1910. A monograph of British graptolites. *Mono-graph of the Palaeontographical Society, London* 9: 359–417.
- Gailite, L., Rybnikova M., and Ulst R. 1967. Stratigrafiâ, fauna i usloviâ obrazovaniâ silurijskah porod srednej Pribaltiki. 304 pp. Izdatelstvo Zinatne, Riga.
- Gortani, M. 1922. Faune Paleozoiche della Sardegna. I. Le graptoliti di Goni. II. Graptoliti della Sardegna Orientale. *Palaeontographica Italica* 28: 51–67, 85–111.
- Gutierez-Marco, J.C., Lenz, A.C., Robardet, M., and Piçarra, J.M. 1996. Wenlock–Ludlow graptolite biostratigraphy and extinction: a reassessment from the southwestern Iberian Peninsula (Spain and Portugal). *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences* 33: 656–663.
- Holland, C.H., Rickards R.B., and Warren P.T. 1969. The Wenlock graptolites of the Ludlow district, Shropshire, and their stratigraphical significance. *Palaeontology* 12: 663–683.
- Jaeger, H. 1959. Graptolithen und Stratigraphie des jüngsten Thüringer Silurs. Abhandlungen der Deutschen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin, Berlin, Klasse für Chemie, Geologie und Biologie, Jahrgang 2: 1–197.
- Jaeger, H. 1975. Die Graptolithenführung in Silur/Devon des Cellon-Profils (Karnische Alpen). *Carinthia II* 165: 111–126.
- Jaeger, H. 1991. Neue Standard-Graptolithenzonenfolge nach der "Grossen Krise" an der Wenlock/Ludlow Grenze (Silur). Neues Jahrbuch für Geologie und Paläeontologie, Abhandlungen 182: 303–354.
- Jaekel, O. 1889. Über das Älter des sogen. Graptolithengesteins. Zeitschrift der Deutschen Geologischen Gesellschaft 41: 653–716.
- Koren', T.N. and Urbanek, A. 1994. Adaptive radiation of monograptids after the Late Wenlock crisis. Acta Palaeontologica Polonica 39: 137–167.
- Koren', T.N., Lenz, A.C., Loydell, D.K., Melchin, M., Štorch, P., and Teller, L. 1996. Generalized graptolite zonal sequence defining Silurian time intervals for global paleogeographic studies. *Lethaia* 29: 59–60.
- Kozłowska-Dawidziuk, A. 1999. Wydarzenie Cyrtograptus lundgreni a rozwój retiolitów (Graptolithina) na platformie wschodnioeuropejskiej. Przegląd Geologiczny 47: 354–358.
- Kozłowska-Dawidziuk, A. 2002. Agastograptus, a synonym of Plectograptus (Retiolitidae, Graptolithina). Acta Palaeontologica Polonica 47: 459–467.

ACTA PALAEONTOLOGICA POLONICA 57 (3), 2012

- Kozłowska-Dawidziuk, A., Lenz, A.C., and Štorch, P. 1998. Late Homerian–early Ludlow post-extinction graptolites, Všeradice, Czech Republic. *Temas Geológico-Mineros ITGE* 23: 97–100.
- Kozłowska-Dawidziuk, A., Lenz, A.C., and Štorch, P. 2001. Upper Wenlock and Lower Ludlow (Silurian), post-extinction graptolites, Všeradice section, Barrandian Area, Czech Republic. *Journal of Palaeontol*ogy 75, 147–164.
- Loydell, D.K., Nestor, V., and Männik, P. 2010. Integrated biostratigraphy of the lower Silurian of the Kolka-54 core, Latvia. *Geological Magazine* 147: 253–280.
- Münch, A. 1952. Die Graptolithen aus dem anstehenden Gotlandium Deutschlands und der Tschechoslowakei. *Geologica* 7: 1–157.
- Obut, A.M., Sobolevskaya, R.F., and Bondarev, V.I. 1965. *Graptolity silura Tajmyra*. 120 pp. Akademia Nauk SSSR Sibirskoe otdelenie, Institut Geologii i Geofiziki, Moskva.
- Paškevičius, J. 1974. Graptolites and zonal subdivision of the Ludlow deposits in the Pribaltica (East Baltic). *In*: A. Obut (ed.), *Graptolites of the USSR*, 122–134. Novosibirsk, Nauka.
- Paškevičius, J. 1979. Biostratigraphy and Graptolites of the Lithuanian Silurian. 267 pp. Mokslas, Vilnius.
- Porębska, E., Kozłowska-Dawidziuk, A., and Masiak, M. 2004. The *lund-greni* event in the Silurian of the East Europe Platform, Poland. *Palaeo-geography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 213: 271–294.
- Přibyl, A. 1943. O nekolika novych graptolitech z českeho a nemeckeho siluru (Gotlandienu). Věstník Královské České Společnosti Nauk, Praha, třída mathematicko-přírodovědecká, Ročník 4: 1–48; published translated into German in Mitteilungen der tschechischen Akademie der Wisseschaften 53: 1–49.
- Přibyl, A. 1958. Ein neuer Beitrag zur Kenntnis der Bulgarischen Graptolithen. Bulletin de l'Institut de géologie près de l'Académie des sciences de Bulgarie 6: 1–117.
- Radzevičius, S. 2003. Pristiograptus (Graptoloidea) from the pernerilundgreni biozones (Silurian) of Lithuania. Carnets de Géologie Article 2003/07 (CG2003_A07_SR): 1–14.
- Radzevičius, S. 2006. Late Wenlock biostratigraphy and the *Pristiograptus* virbalensis group (Graptolithina) in Lithuania and the Holy Cross Mountains. *Geological Quarterly* 50: 333–344.
- Radzevičius, S. 2007. The genus *Pristiograptus* in Wenlock of east Baltic and Holy Cross Mountains. *Dissertationes Geologicae Universitatis Tartuensis* 20: 1–131.
- Radzevičius, S. and Paškevičius J. 2000. *Pristiograptids* (Graptolites) and their adaptive types of the Wenlock (Silurian) in Lithuania. *Geologija* 32: 88–109.
- Radzevičius, S. and Paškevičius J. 2005. Pristiograptus (Graptoloidea) from the Upper Wenlock of the Baltic Countries. Sratigraphy and Geological Correlation 13: 47–56.
- Radzevičius, S., Paškevičius, J., and Meidla, T. 2008. Kai kurių silūro graptolitų evoliucija ir filogenija. *Geologijos akiračiai* 2: 35–42.
- Radzevičius, S., Raczyński P., Pluta, K., and Kojelė, A. 2010. Findings Report: Graptolites from Silurian Erratic Boulders of Mokrzeszów quarry (Lower Silesia, Poland). Archiv für Geschiebekunde 6: 51–60.
- Rickards, R.B. 1965. New Silurian graptolites from the Howgill Fells (Northern England). *Palaeontology* 8: 248–271.
- Rickards, R.B. and Wright, A.J. 1999. Systematics, biostratigraphy and evolution of the Late Ludlow and Přidoli (Late Silurian) graptolites of the Yass District, New South Wales, Australia. *Records of the Australian Museum* 51: 187–214.
- Rickards, R.B. and Wright, A.J. 2003. The *Pristiograptus dubius* (Suess, 1851) species group and it iterative evolution in the Mid- and Late Silurian. *Scottish Journal of Geology* 39: 61–69.
- Saether, O.A. 1979. Underlying synapomorphies and anagenetic analysis. *Zoologica Scripta* 8: 305–312.
- Saether, O.A. 1983. Canalized evolutionary potential: inconsistencies in phylogenetic reasoning. *Systematic Zoology* 32: 343–359.
- Sluys, R. 1989. Rampant Parallelism: An appraisal of the use of nonuniversal derived character states in phylogenetic reconstruction. *Systematic Zoology* 38: 350–370.

- Suess, E. 1851. Über böhmische Graptolithen. Naturwissenschaftliche Abhandlungen von Haidinger, Wien 4: 87–134.
- Twitchett, R.J. 2007. The Lilliput effect in the aftermath of the end-Permian extinction event. *Palaeogeography*, *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 252: 132–144.
- Ulst, R. 1974. The early sequence of pristiograptids in conterminous deposits of Wenlock and Ludlow of the Middle Pribaltic. *In*: A. Obut (ed.), *Graptolites of the USSR*, 105–122. Novosibirsk, Nauka.
- Urbanek, A. 1953. O dwóch gatunkach Monograptidae. Acta Geologica Polonica 3: 277–297.
- Urbanek, A. 1959. Studies on graptolites I. Development and structure. *Pristiograptus gotlandicus* (Perner). *Acta Palaeontologica Polonica* 4: 11–26.
- Urbanek, A. 1993. Biotic crises in the history of Upper Silurian graptoloids: a Palaeobiological model. *Historical Biology* 7: 29–50.
- Urbanek, A. 1996. The origin and maintenance of diversity: a case study of Upper Silurian graptoloids. *In*: G. Pinna (ed.), Systematic Biology as an Historical Science. *Memorie della Societa Italiana di Scienze Naturali e del Museo Civico di Storia Naturale di Milano* 26: 119–127.

- Urbanek, A. 1997. Late Ludfordian and early Přidoli monograptids from the Polish Lowland. *In*: A. Urbanek and L. Teller (eds.), Silurian Graptolite Faunas of the East European Platform: Stratigraphy and Evolution. *Palaeontologia Polonica* 56: 157–159.
- Urbanek, A. 1998. Oligophyly and evolutionary parallelism: A case study of Silurian graptolites. *Acta Palaeontologica Polonica* 43: 549–57.
- Urbanek, A. and Teller, L. 1997. Graptolites and stratigraphy of Wenlock and Ludlow Series in the East European Platform. *In*: A. Urbanek and L. Teller (eds.), Silurian Graptolite Faunas of the East European Platform: Stratigraphy and Evolution. *Palaeontologia Polonica* 56: 157–159.
- Walker 1953. The development of *Monograptus dubius* and *Monograptus chimaera*. *Geological Magazine* 90: 362–373.
- Wood, E.M.R. 1900. The Lower Ludlow formation and its graptolite fauna. Quarterly Journal of the Geological Society of London 56: 415–492.
- van der Spoel, S. 1983. Patterns in Plankton Distribution and the Relation to Speciation: The Dawn of Pelagic Biogeography. *In*: R.W. Sims, J.H. Price, and P.E.S. Whalley (eds.), *Evolution, Time and Space: the Emergence of the Biosphere*, 291–334. Academic Press, London.